



MEMORANDUM

To: Project Selection Committee

From: CMAP Staff

Date: July 2014

Re: Project Type Changes for the CMAQ Program

During this year's process review of the Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality Improvement (CMAQ) program, a recurring theme has been the robustness of evaluation techniques and the effectiveness of various project types. The review has concentrated on whether a given project type is appropriate for federal funding, whether its benefits are properly measurable so that it can be compared against other project types, and the region's success with the projects. Three project subtypes suggest a need for further discussion with stakeholders:

- Travel demand management (TDM) marketing and outreach
- Pedestrian facilities
- Bicycle parking

This memo provides initial recommendations for changes in how these project types are handled in the CMAQ program.

Rethinking Marketing and Outreach Programs

At the February meeting of the Project Selection Committee, sponsors of TDM marketing and outreach projects were invited to present to the committee on the status of their projects. Prototypical projects in this category advertise a transit service, provide consumer-level information about government air quality programs, and produce general marketing materials (e.g., brochures, promotional items, etc.). Over \$15 million in CMAQ funds has been allocated to these marketing and outreach projects since 2004. A list of all the projects funded since 1993 are listed at the end of this document.

It is difficult to say what actual benefits the region has received for its investment thus far, since limited evaluation has been done of these projects' success. When the projects are analyzed for potential air quality benefits, the experiences of other programs in other regions are often used to estimate the benefits of the proposed project in the region. For existing projects that are seeking continued funding, however, the region could benefit from performance metrics that can be used to determine how well these programs meet their goals.

Furthermore, although many are regional in scope, they are often treated as independent ventures. A commute options program through the Regional Transportation Authority (RTA) was funded in 2012 and then the City of Chicago applied as part of the FFY 2014-2018 cycle for its own version. Both efforts similar in scope, and seemingly there is no need for two separate programs. The duplicate effort seems to indicate that the region lacks a coordinated vision for these regional TDM marketing/outreach efforts.

A possible consideration would be to fund a regional TDM vision plan with UWP funding. A plan would not only provide a means for coordinated marketing and outreach efforts but could help develop performance metrics that could be used to analyze these projects and provide accountability. At present, it appears that the Illinois Department of Transportation (IDOT) is taking leadership in this area and may fund a 5-year commute options program that will serve as a template for a statewide program. This program is still in the discussion phase and may change.

It is recommended that funding for new standalone TDM marketing/outreach efforts be discontinued until a coordinated regional strategy is put in place. Future TDM priorities and projects to fund through CMAQ could come from this regional strategy. Finally, note that this section is only addressing standalone TDM marketing/outreach activities. For example, if CMAQ funds a new bus service and the service operator would like to market that new service, such a cost item would be eligible.

Rethinking Pedestrian Facilities

As part of the FY 2014-2018 Call for Projects, the Project Selection Committee agreed to only consider pedestrian facilities projects which provide direct access to high ridership transit stops and stations. Even though this was stated in the application materials, several applications were submitted for neighborhood infill sidewalk projects.

To reduce confusion and develop a more coherent project type, the pedestrian facility project type should be eliminated and a new subcategory of transit improvements projects created which would deal specifically with transit access. A new subcategory which is being called access to transit would be part of the transit submittal. The access to transit category could consider other means to access transit beyond just pedestrian facilities, such as bicycle facilities and parking at a station or transfer location. The bicycle facilities project detailed here would be focused on addressing the areas directly around a transit facility.

Rethinking Bicycle Parking

One of the smaller project types eligible under the CMAQ program is the bicycle parking category. CMAQ has funded 17 bicycle parking projects at just over \$7 million since 1992, and more than half of the projects were less than \$42,000 federal. In fact, providing standard "U" racks is inexpensive and they are not especially difficult to install. Given the strings attached to the funding, using the region's federal funds on projects of this size and magnitude may not be its most appropriate use.

Furthermore, the current analysis method used to develop the emissions benefits for bike parking projects is inadequate to properly measure the potential benefits of these projects. The analysis uses the population and work trips for the municipality requesting the funds in conjunction with fixed diversion rates and fixed trip lengths. The analysis does not account for the number of racks or the placement of them. A review of literature and other regions did not turn up any useful information on how bike parking projects could be better analyzed. If Committee members are aware of a method being used by others, they should contact staff with details.

Given the small size and scope of most bicycle parking projects and the difficulty of estimating emissions benefits, it is recommended that bicycle parking not be funded under CMAQ. Under the access to transit subcategory, bicycle parking at transit stations would still be eligible for funding.

Action Requested: Discussion

CMAQ Funded TDM Marketing and Outreach Programs – 1992-2014

TIP ID	Sponsor	Description	CMAQ Funds	Balance of Funds
		Southwest Rapid Transit Line	\$840,000	\$0
01-94-0187	CTA	Marketing		
13-95-0026	IEPA	Regional Ozone Info	\$880,000	\$0
16-96-0001	CTA	Green Line Corridor Marketing Prgm	\$1,000,000	\$0
16-99-0019	CTA	New Resident Marketing Program	\$455,200	\$0
		Regionwide Bicycle to Shopping	\$52,675	\$0
13-97-0001	CDOT	Promotion		
13-97-0002	IEPA	Partners for Clean Air Marketing	\$9,895,885	\$365,297
16-99-0018	CTA	Corporate Relocation Assistance	\$88,772	\$0
13-99-0005	Pace	Regional Rideshare Incentives Prgm	\$148,000	\$0
		New Resident/Student Bike Marketing	\$5,986,315	\$4,566,218
01-01-0011	CDOT	Program		
16-02-0011	CTA	Bus Circulator Marketing System	\$24,482	\$0
		Transportation Demand Management	\$79,959	\$0
03-04-0005	Schaumburg	Program		
16-04-0002	CTA	Cermak (Douglas) Corridor Marketing	\$480,000	\$0
		DuPage County Transit Service	\$480,000	\$480,000
08-05-0002	RTA	Marketing		
13-06-0003	RTA	Transit Use Campaign	\$1,000,000	\$0
		Walk Chicago-Pedestrian	\$160,000	\$160,000
01-06-0004	CDOT	Encouragement Program		
		TMA Lake-Cook Rideshare Commuter	\$36,317	\$0
10-06-0002	Lake County	Connection		
		Tri-State Tollway Construction	\$49,965	\$0
13-06-0010	Pace	Commute Alternatives		
		West Side/West Suburban Service Imp	\$640,000	\$544,240
16-06-0002	CTA	- Marketing		
13-09-0004	DuPage Co	Bike to Metra Marketing	\$84,000	\$0
13-10-0011	RTA	Clean Air Commuter Challenge	\$326,400	\$80,198
13-12-0004	RTA	Chicagoland Commute Options	\$1,112,184	\$1,050,309
03-12-0013	Schaumburg	Bike-to-Metra Guides: Round 2	\$76,800	\$0
17-12-0002	Pace	Regional Rideshare Program	\$1,150,000	\$1,070,240
			\$25,046,954	\$8,316,502